



**PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT  
PLANNING DIVISION**

455 Mountain Village Blvd.  
Mountain Village, CO 81435  
(970) 728-1392

---

**TO:** Design Review Board  
**FROM:** Sam Starr, Planner  
**FOR:** Meeting of December 12, 2017  
**DATE:** December 8, 2017  
**RE:** Conceptual Work Session for New Roofing Materials in the Village Center

---

**PROJECT GEOGRAPHY**

**Application Overview:** The purpose of this agenda item is to allow the Design Review Board (DRB) to provide initial direction to town planning staff regarding new roofing material in the Village Center.

**Legal Description:** Lot OS3X-RR  
**Address:** N/A  
**Applicant/Agent:** Town of Mountain Village  
**Owner:** Town of Mountain Village  
**Zoning:** Open Space  
**Existing Use:** Open Space  
**Proposed Use:** Open Space  
**Lot Size:** 2.73 acres

**Adjacent Land Uses:**

- **North:** Open Space
- **South:** Open Space
- **East:** Village Center
- **West:** Village Center

**ATTACHMENTS**

- Exhibit A: OZ Architecture Mock-Ups
- Exhibit B: USFS Report on Alternative Roofing Materials for Historic Structures

**BACKGROUND**

In 2014 West Tile, the manufacturer of the existing roof tile in the Village Center, went out of business. Subsequently, both the Town of Mountain Village and the Telluride Mountain Village Owners Association (TMVOA) have received numerous inquiries as to how the businesses and tenants should go forward with roof replacement. To address these concerns, the Town of Mountain Village has submitted for a DRB Work Session to have an informal, non-binding review and discussion about the project, potential issues, and possible solutions that meet the intent and standards of the Community Development Code Design Standards.

## **ANALYSIS OF RELEVANT CODE SECTIONS**

### **17.5.6 C.3 Roof Material**

- a. All roofing material shall be of a type and quality that will withstand high alpine climate conditions.
- b. The review authority may require class A roofing materials as a fire mitigation measure.
- c. Permitted roof material outside the Village Center include:
  - i. Rusted, black or gray standing seam or corrugated metal;
  - ii. Zinc;
  - iii. Minimum 1/2" slate; and
  - iv. Synthetic materials that have been approved by the Design Review Board for general use after having been used on individual projects and the Board makes the finding that the material has proven to meet the standards stated below.
- d. Village Center roofing material shall be concrete tile or synthetic materials that emulate concrete tile of the color burnt sienna except for special copper accent roofs that shall require specific approval of the DRB.
- e. The following roofing materials may be approved by the DRB as a specific approval that is processed as a class 3 development application if the DRB finds the roofing material is consistent with the town design theme and the applicable Design Regulations:
  - i. Copper;
    - (a) Copper shall only be considered when it is proposed with a brown or verde patina finish where visible except for the Village Center where a verde patina finish is required.
    - (b) The copper finish shall be completed prior to issuing a certificate of occupancy.
  - ii. Galvanized corrugated or standing seam metal (not rusted or reflective);
  - iii. Synthetic roofing material that accurately emulates wood shake, concrete and slate tile or any other roofing material permitted or existing in Mountain Village.
    - (a) Synthetic roofing material shall be:
      - (i.) Durable
      - (ii.) High strength, both material and shape;
      - (iii.) Low absorption or permeability;
      - (iv.) High freeze/thaw damage resistance;
      - (v.) Color throughout the tile (not surface applied); and
      - (vi.) High-quality design that fits within the architectural context of the building and the architectural context of the surrounding area.
- f. The following requirements are applicable to all roofing:
  - i. Metal roofing surface shall not reflect an excessive amount of light when viewed against direct sunlight.
  - ii. Unless the DRB grants a specific approval for a non-rusted metal roof, corrugated and standing seam roofing materials shall be pre-treated to produce rusting prior to placement on the roof, and prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

- g. The installation or re-installation of wood shakes, glazed tile and asphalt shingles is prohibited, except for the repair or replacement of wood shake areas that are 25% or less of the total roof surface area.
- h. Roof flashing, Gutters Downspouts and Similar Hardware:
  - i. In the Village Center, all exposed metal flashing, gutters, downspouts and other roof hardware shall be copper except when either structural requirements dictate the use of stronger materials such as for snow fences.
  - ii. In all other areas, other metal guttering besides copper may be approved by the review authority to allow it to match roofing material, such as the use of rusty steel guttering on a rusty metal roof.
  - iii. When steel or iron are used, they shall be either rusted to match the roof or finished with a baked-on enamel paint or, subject to the prior approval of the review authority, a silicon modified alloy or special epoxy paint system of a color approved by the review authority.

## **ANALYSIS OF ROOFING OPTIONS**

### **Comparative Analysis Of Roofing Material in Ski Towns**

In order to determine the most viable options for roof material replacement, Town of Mountain Village Planning and Development Staff analyzed guiding documents from: Vail, Colorado; Banff, Canada; and Beaver Creek, Colorado. In addition to being of similar size and character, each of these ski towns has a distinctive commercial district similar to Mountain Village's Village Center. The following roof material codes were pulled from each town's respective website, and follow up interviews were conducted with planners from that town to confirm that the code language was most up-to-date, and that no other roof material changes were slated for the near future.

#### **Vail, CO**

Roofs:

"Where visible, roofs are often one of the most dominant architectural elements in any built environment. In the Village roof form, color and texture are visibly dominant, and generally consistent, which tends to unify the building diversity to a great degree. The current expression, and objective, for roofs in the Village is to form a consistently unifying backdrop for the architecture and pedestrian streetscape, and to avoid roofs, which tend to stand out individually or distract visually from the overall character."

Roof Materials:

"Wood-shakes, wood shingles, and built-up tow and gravel are almost exclusively used as roof materials in the Village. For visual consistency, any other materials should have the appearance of the above."

#### **Beaver Creek, CO**

Roof Materials:

"Roof materials shall be limited to: fire resistant unit pieces of slate, flat profile unglazed tile, composite shakes (as may be approved by the DRB on a case by case basis), if such product is deemed to successfully emulate a true cedar shake or slate material in size, texture and color,

but not asphalt shingles or wood shakes. In addition, copper shingle and standing seam copper roofs are permitted, but only if treated prior to installation to accelerate the natural weathering process and to reduce the amount of off-site glare produced from untreated copper; and tile colors shall be blue-gray, green-gray, or brown-gray and shall have a weathered appearance. Glazed tiles and galvanized and/or painted metal roofing shall not be used.”

Banff, Canada

Roofing Materials:

“Materials shall give the appearance of being local in origin and having been handcrafted. Industrial or high-tech looking materials (e.g.: pre-finished metal siding or standing-seam roofing, vinyl siding, reflective glass), materials with strong cultural connotations (e.g.: bright red roof tiles, swirl stucco) or imitation materials (e.g. “cultured stone” or “glue-on-brick”) are not acceptable. The exceptions are the Commercial Service District, being less visible to visitors, where metal siding and roofing are acceptable and developments in moderate or high wildfire risk zones (see Schedule “F”, Wildfire Risk Zones Map) where fire retardant roofing material with a minimum ULC rating of Class A or B shall be used. Metal and other fire-retardant roofing materials that provide a shake or shingle-like textured appearance and fibre-cement siding may be permitted in these areas, however standing-seam, flat or reflective metal roofs are not acceptable. Fire resistant siding material should be used in moderate and high-risk zones.”

**Cost and Warranty Matrix of Potential Replacements**

JNB Roofing, a local roofing contractor that routinely does roofing work in the Village Center, provided the cost-matrix below to inform DRB deliberation. The list of potential roofing materials is not exhaustive, and more options are available. Under current code, only synthetic or concrete tile of a burnt sienna color is allowed; any changes to materials featured below will require a code amendment.

<b>Material</b>	<b>Price Range (per sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Warranty Info. (Years)</b>	<b>Life Expectancy (Years)</b>
Tile	\$8-10	No Warranty	30-50
Synthetic Tile	\$12-14	50	50
Slate	\$7-9	No Warranty	100+
Synthetic Slate	\$14-16	50	50
Asphalt	\$4-6	50	50
Copper	\$16-20	No Warranty	50
Corten	\$8-10	No Warranty	20
Painted Steel	\$7-9	30-40	40-50
Bonderized Standing Seam	\$6-8	No Warranty	15-30

Extending the Life of the Existing Concrete Tile Option:

The town met with Metacrylics a few months back and invited them to attend this special work session. We invite you, during your lunch hour, to ask general questions regarding their product. As an alternative to replacing the concrete tile roofs, Metacrylics provides a product that protects and extends the life of concrete tile. Their product also can protect standing seam metal roofs. We have provided a sample board of their concrete tile preserving product. Staff

felt it was important to share this information as an alternative for owners of buildings that may wish to extend the life of the existing concrete tile roofs.

**Existing Secondary Roofing Materials in the Village Center**

As of December 2017, eleven (11) applications have been submitted for secondary roofing materials to replace the existing tile. The applications are listed below:

<b>Village Core Structure</b>	<b>Secondary Roofing Material</b>
The Inn at Lost Creek	Copper Standing Seam
Granita at Mountain Village Condominiums	Copper Standing Seam and Shingles
Gondola Stations	Standing Seam
Franz Klammer Hotel	Copper Standing Seam
Le Chamonix Comdominiums	Standing Seam
Telluride Conference Center	Copper Standing Seam
Palmyra Condominiums	Copper Standing Seam
Westermere Condominiums	Rusted Corrugated
The Madeline Hotel	Standing Seam and Cedar Shake
The Lumiere Hotel	Standing Seam
Belvedere Condominiums	Cedar Shake

Development trends indicate that there is a strong desire for a darker, high-quality standing seam. The copper secondary roofs are either a darker brown or black (with a few notable green accents), and the standing seam roofs are black. To ensure unified roofing, DRB may consider proposing a different set of requirements for secondary roofs that complement the changes that have already occurred.

**Historic Preservation Considerations**

In 2007, The United States Forest Service published the “Alternative Roofing Materials: A Guide for Historic Structures” report to help communities guide aesthetic decision-making for historic structures. This report illustrates the challenges presented with replacing roofs on “significant historic structures”, and then details the alternative materials that should be used to replace existing roofing. The suggested replacement materials include: asphalt shingles, metal shingles, concrete tile shingles, and engineered molded (synthetic) shingles. In addition to many products having class A fire ratings, the USFS report advocates for these types of replacements because these roof materials keep color, tend to be more durable in harsher climates, and preserve the existing character of these significant historic structures. The publication is attached as exhibit A. to this memo. Although we do not consider our Village Center historic, the publication is helpful in providing details regarding different types of roofing materials that align with the range of acceptable materials we are considering. Also, the DRB can consider whether there are any anchor or landmark buildings in the Village Center that may need more attention or consideration when a material change is requested.

**RECOMMENDATION**

By incorporating past discussions and recent alternative roof material approvals in the Village Center, staff recommends the following general direction and key points:

- Allow for a range of materials that maintains a unified theme
- Consider natural and rich materials like patina copper, slate and zinc
- Consider synthetic materials when of high quality (e.g synthetic slate)

- Consider a unified or diverse shape of roof materials (tiles versus standing seam)
- Discuss preferred palette for primary and secondary roof themes.

### **Conclusion**

Work sessions provide an opportunity for the DRB to informally review a proposed application. As such, the DRB can only provide general comments and direction, with no formal decision. It should also be noted that Staff conducts only a high level, cursory review, with the more detailed and thorough review left to the formal process. Therefore, the DRB and staff review and comments will evolve as the project moves through the DRB process.